

# “LAUGH OR LAMENT”: CIRCULATION OF IDEAS BY TRANSLATION<sup>1</sup>

AŖl ARABOĐLU

Doç. Dr., Trakya Üniversitesi Edebiyat Fakóltesi, asliaraboglu@trakya.edu.tr, ORCID: : 0000-0001-6910-5706

Arabođlu, AŖl. “Laugh or Lament”: Circulation of Ideas by Translation”. idil, 100 (2022 Aralık): s. 1695–1704. doi: 10.7816/idil-11-100-01

## ABSTRACT

The purpose of this paper is to present an example of the circulation of ideas in the form of “laugh or lament” which is the collection of short stories by Aziz Nesin. The cause to question the basic problem is the translation of satires in the short stories in the context of circulation of ideas, which (do not) consist of Aziz Nesin’s style. The paper, from different perspectives, but based on Aziz Nesin’s satire style, aims to analyze the circulation of ideas by translation. Aziz Nesin is widely regarded as one of the prominent Turkish authors, with his satirical language; he targets the absurdity of hypocrisy, corruption in a society, the dehumanizing effect of excessive bureaucracy, and unexpected problems and solutions in life, which are all cultural. As it is well known throughout the history of the literature, the best satirical work should provoke the readers by enabling them to understand the targets of the author. In Turkish, Aziz Nesin has been well understood by his target audience, and still exists in a bestseller status. However, his stories are not just made up of humor sense but also full of allusion. Thus, as Lawrence Venuti (1998) told in his work *The Scandals of Translation*, and considering that Aziz Nesin’s specified short stories are ranked as bestsellers, in the hope of a similar performance in a different language and culture, the translation of the short stories is expected to reinforce literary, moral, religious, or political values already held by that reader. When the translations of the short stories have been analyzed, it has been seen that the translation does not seem to have the same satirical aims. However, it can be said that the circulation of ideas has been completed by translation, transformation of satire and information. In the paper, by using Lawrence Venuti’s “bestseller” concept, the translator’s choices will be analyzed considering the features of bestsellers. Thus, this perspective can give readers a wide opinion to understand the translator’s choices, and by presenting an example of the circulation of ideas, how the translation effects this “circle” will be described.

**Keywords:** Aziz Nesin, a bestseller, circulation of ideas, satire

*Makale Bilgisi:Arařtırma-İnceleme*

*Geliř: 11 Kasım 2022*

*Düzeltilme: 6 Aralık 2022*

*Kabul: 29 Aralık 2022*

© 2022 idil. Bu makale Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY-NC-ND) 4.0 lisansı ile yayımlanmaktadır.

<sup>1</sup> The brief part of this study was presented online at “Network I: International Conference on The Circulation of Ideas, Concepts, Works and Other Things” on 10/10/22.

## Introduction

Today, the circulation of ideas through translation becomes a part of new perspectives in translation works within the scope of literature translation, translation sociology, translation philosophy, etc. The circulation of ideas through translation can make it easy to map the meaning and categorize different cultures in their system by forming literary structures. As Culler stated there are different dimensions or levels of meaning:

“The meaning of a word, of an utterance, and a text. Possible meanings of words contribute to the meaning of an utterance, which is an act by a speaker. (And the meanings of words, in turn, come from the things they might do in utterances.) Finally, the text, which here represents an unknown speaker making this enigmatical utterance, is something an author has constructed, and its meaning is not a proposition but what it *does*, its potential to affect readers” (Culler, 2000, p. 64).

Analyzing translation solutions helps to understand the meaning, possible meaning and potential to have an impact on readers. The circulation of ideas in the form of laugh or lament which is the collection of short stories by Aziz Nesin can be achieved by the analysis of translation. The reason for preparing this work is to question the translation solutions, and to arrive at the description of the circulation of ideas by translation.

Aziz Nesin is one of the most important authors in Turkey. Besides his other works, he is widely popular with his satirical works (poems, short stories, novels, etc.) He is the author of more than 100 books, also referred as the Humorist and the Poet. His works have been translated into over thirty languages. Also, he had many national and international awards. In his works, with his satirical language, he targets the absurdity of hypocrisy in society by telling true life stories, corruption in all parts of the society, dehumanizing effects, and results of excessive bureaucracy in the country and with the composition of all of them he tries to achieve unexpected problem and solutions in life, which are cultural.

The author’s worldwide popularity mainly stemmed in a large part from his satirical language with a socialist slant. It can be said that with his satirical works he is continuously in a best-seller status in Turkey. But, to gather the same value in English, his translated books also have to meet the cultural expectations of different cultures. They need to be inscribed with codes and ideologies that support political agendas in the domestic culture while constructing a cultural identity for the foreign country.

As it is well known, to invest in bestsellers has become so prevalent issue for many years. However, the main focus of the publisher’s attention on foreign texts is to be commercially successful in their native cultures allowing the editorial and translating process to be guided by the hope of a similar performance in a different language and culture (Venuti, 1998). In this way, the bestsellers books which address the major concerns of a population are expected to meet the foreign culture’s expectations as in the domestic culture.

Besides, the translator is assumed as having perfect knowledge of both foreign and domestic cultures. Otherwise, the translation will not maintain the domestic features and serve foreign interests. The target text may not easily achieve its value in the target system. As Susan Bassnet utters by summarizing what Benjamin Edward Sapir Lee Whorf stated about language and culture: “Language, then, is the heart within the body of culture, and it is the interaction between the two that results in the continuation of life-energy” (Bassnet, 2005, p.23). Interlingual and intercultural translation works support this continuation of life energy. Translation becomes the heart of the body that realizes in the context of culture. Thus, it is impossible to separate the translation from the culture, the language from the context, the heart from body, the words from the meaning. Due to the circulation of translated texts, expressions continue to exist in different language systems. Even, the translated texts have been transformed in a different manner in the language systems, they are placed uniquely.

### 1. Aziz Nesin and Selected Short Stories in English

Translated stories in English which have been selected to analyze in this study, are the parts of a collection. However, Turkish short stories are complex works of Aziz Nesin from different books and they have been selected to be compared and analyzed with their translations. The stories *Tarzan’ın Sahibi Kim?* and “*Ajan OX-13*” are from the book of Nazik Alet which was published by Nesin Publishing House and the story *Fareler Birbirini Yer* is from the book of “*Ah Biz Eşekler*” which was also published by Nesin Publishing House.

The starting point of this work is the translation as a collection that was published in 2002 by the Publishing Department of the Ministry of Culture of the Republic of Turkey. The translator is Masud Akhtar Sheikh from Pakistani and he has many original works in Pakistani and Turkish. One of his original works is “*Modern Pakistan*

Literature” which was written in Turkish. He has books about Turkish authors and he has translated several works from Turkish authors into Urdu and English. As he has many books about Turkey and Turkish authors he is known as the “Representative of Turkish Literature” in Pakistan (Mubeen, 2022).

In one of the interviews with the author and the translator Sheikh, he mentions about his acquaintance with Turkish literature and he refers to Aziz Nesin as the most important author he knew at that time:

“My acquaintance with Turkish literature started in 1963 after my joint to the Turkish Military Academy course. The only writer I knew at that time was Aziz Nesin. I followed closely his humorous works and criticisms in Akbaba Magazine. I saw that his writings overlapped with Pakistan in a sense. When I went to my country, I translated Nesin's stories and had them published in many newspapers. More than 150 stories have been published. At that time, they thought that these articles were written for Pakistan's intelligentsia because the same problems were experienced in my country. If you consider the political situation of Pakistan in those years, I cannot say that I am not afraid to write them. But I continued to translate Turkish literature<sup>2</sup>”(Konya Yenigün News).

The translator’s aim is to circulate the knowledge in Turkish in the Pakistani literature system through English translation in 2002. Besides this interview the preface of the translator also shows the point of view about his approach to the translation. In this first edition of the book, the translator’s preface was published within a book. Although, we cannot see this preface in the sixth edition, published by Nesin Books in 2006. As the texts like prefaces, notes, interviews can be considered as paratexts which accompany the main text give information about this main texts (Genette, 1997) the interview and the preface can be accepted as the paratexts that show the aim of the translator.

In the preface; the translator complains that very little readers know about Turkish authors. According to him, Turkish authors have to be introduced to the world.

“The number of Turkish-knowing Pakistanis who can undertake the translation of masterpieces of Turkish literature for the benefit of Pakistani readers can be counted on fingertips. As against this acute shortage, there is a profusion of excellent Turkish writers with an amazingly large treasures, and poetry. They are all clamoring to be introduced to the World, to be read with the appreciation they deserve” (Nesin, 2002, p. IX).

He criticizes us, Turkish people, not to give sufficient interest to our literature and we are mesmerized by the superiority of English literature over Turkish literature. He underestimates western literature and gives a great respect to the Turks. Besides the translator considers Aziz Nesin as a «literary giant» in his preface. Thus, it would be revealing to consider also Aziz Nesin as a bestseller whose main function is communication and reference of his time.

“Unfortunately, the Turks themselves have also not been showing much interest in introducing a host of their literary giants and their exquisite works to the outside world. They have been mesmerized by the so-called superiority of English literature over their own. No wonder, thousands of novels by British and American writers are being translated into Turkish every year. The worst part of this phenomenon is that the most of the foreign literature flooding the Turkish market is of mediocre nature, if they are not all junk. That a nation as proud and self-respecting as the Turks should ignore its own valuable literature and cherish the mundane works of Western writers, some which cannot even be categorized as literature, is really distressing” (Nesin, 2002, p.IX).

In the last part of the preface, the translator mentions his aims more clearly by stating to create «a stir» in the literary circles of Pakistan with the English translation of Turkish literature as Bestseller.

“This book created a stir in the literary circles of Pakistan, which have since been demanding more works on Turkish literature in Urdu and English” (Nesin, 2002, p.IX).

---

<sup>2</sup> Unless it is mentioned, I have done translations of the interview in this study.

Later, in 2006, the book was republished as a second edition by Nesin books in 2006, It was also proofread by Elizabeth Ann Skewes and Çiçek Eriş. When these two editions are compared, it can be stated that there are not any significant differences in the context of their translations. However, as the aim of translation and the publishing house has been changed we cannot see the preface of the translator in this version.

## 2. Translating a “Bestseller”

As Venuti stated in his book “The Scandals of Translation, The *Bestseller*”, a bestseller can be defined as who reaches a mass readership and appeals to different constituencies, and so inevitably crosses the cultural borders between them. Besides, when the bestseller is also a translated text, the border crossing increase (Venuti, 1998). A bestselling translation text tends to reveal much more about the domestic culture in which it was produced, than the foreign culture that it is taken to represent. According to Venuti, the foreign text (translation) has been made to serve domestic culture’s (source culture) interests, and therefore neither sale projections nor reviews can be seen as true and objective assessments of its value. On the contrary, the foreign text that achieves bestseller status through translation becomes a site where values increase unexpectedly. It can be said that the cultural condition in any book, translated or not, becomes a bestseller (Venuti, 1998).

When translating a bestseller, fluent strategies that produce the illusory effect of transparency on translation are considered. These are; the narrative must be comprehensible, the language must fix the precise meanings in simple, the text must have continuous syntax with the most familiar lexicon. Thus, fluent strategies are “Linear syntax”, “Univocal meaning”, “Currents usage”, and “Lexical consistency” (Venuti, 1998, 126). However, “unidiomatic constructions”, “Polysemy”, “Archaism”, “Jargon”, and any linguistic effect that calls attention to the words or interrupts the reader’s identification are avoided. Translation a text fluently; the emphasis is placed on familiarity of the text, on making the language so recognizable as to be invisible. This may guaranty not only the widest possible domestic audience that could be achieved by the foreign text but also extensive domestication is provided that an inscription with cultural and political values that currently prevail in the domestic situation-including those values according to which the foreign culture is represented (Venuti, 1998, p. 126).

In the translation of a bestseller, it is expected to reinforce literary, moral, religious, or political values already held by that reader. Of course, there would be some shifts by the translator. The shift from the foreign culture to domestic culture circulates the foreign text information from the linguistic and literary traditions from where it draws its significance, ensuring that it will be interpreted and evaluated differently in translation. Thus, as the translation circulates within the domestic culture, it will lead to multiple lives among various social groups. Bestselling translations must be illegible for the foreign culture, often stereotypes that permit easy recognition. It is provided that, domestic readers adopt a popular approach within a realistic representation that was inflected with their codes and ideologies for an immediate encounter with a foreign text and culture (Venuti, 1998, p. 126).

## 3. Analysis of the Translations of Aziz Nesin’s Short Stories as a Bestseller

### Example 1.

#### Source Text

“OX-13 şifresiyle ülkesinin casusluk örgütünde yazılı olan ajanın Türkiye’de kullanacağı takma ad Riçirt Veling’di (Richard Veling). Riçirt Veling çalışacağı ülkeye gitmeden önce o ülke halkının dilini öğrenirdi. Türkiye’ye gelmeden önce de, Türkçeyi öğrenmişti. Dil öğrenmekte büyük yeteneği vardı. Türkiye’ye yerleşip burada birkaç ay kaldıktan sonra Türkçesini iyice ilerletmişti” (Nesin, 2005a, p. 13).

#### Target Text

“Designated as Ox-13 within the intelligence set-up of his own country, he was given the cover name of Richard Vent for the duration of his latest assignment.

Richard Vent had a great flair for learning foreign languages. Before taking up a job in any foreign country, he always made it a point to master the local language. He thought this to be a great help in the discharge of his duties. It did not take him long to acquire a working knowledge of the Turkish language before embarking upon his new job" (Nesin, 2002, p. 112).<sup>3</sup>

In this example, the translator has changed the name and the surname of the agent in the target text. "Veiling" in the source text means; any of various light sheer fabrics, even "vent" in the target text means an opening for the escape. They are almost the opposite and the translator considered the form in case of the meaning. Besides, later in the story of source text, we learn that the agent's name changed to Veli. The author may have used "Veiling" in order to evoke readers to remember the name "Veli". However, as we look at the whole text, it can be seen that the translator generally tries to make explanations to give the exact meaning and he chooses the meaning in case of the form.

### **Example 2.**

#### Source Text

"Bir yabancı dili en iyi öğrenmenin yolu, o dili anadili olarak konuşan bir kadınla evlenmekmiş. Riçirt Veling'in de, Türkiye'de üstlendiği gizli görevi başarabilmesi, Türklerden hiç ayırt edilemeyecek denli Türkçe konuşması, bu beceriyi elde etmek için de bir Türk kadınla evlenmesi gerekiyordu. Böyle bir genç kadın buldu. Evlenmek için herşey yolunda giderken, genç kadının anababası, Riçirt Veling'in Müslüman olmasını ileri sürdüler. Yoksa kızlarını ona vermeyeceklerdi" (Nesin, 2005a, p. 13).

#### Target Text

"However, the delicate nature of his present mission necessitated a superlative mastery of the language so that he could go about as a Turk. The day he came across the maxim: «The best way to master a language is to have a longhaired dictionary, » he decided to marry a Turkish lady he did find one but his would-be in-laws insisted that Richard should embrace Islam before marriage. For a person like Richard Vent, religion had no connotation except devotion to duty. Professional expediency could overnight convert him to any religion. He therefore readily agreed to become a Muslim, little realizing the physical implications involved...." (Nesin, 2002, p.112).

It can be seen that "woman" become foreignized at the translation. He adds new meaning to the text with "a longhaired dictionary". Bu considering the target society, he choose to domesticate the source text.

### **Example 3.**

#### Source Text

"...her fedakarlığı göze alan ünlü ajan bütün dinsel törenlerden geçmiş, takma adı olan Riçirt Veling'i de Reşat Veli yapmıştı. Böylece Reşat Veli, artık kendisine rahatça çalışabileceği bir ortam yaratmıştı" (Nesin, 2005a, p. 14).

#### Target Text

"The rituals over, Richard over, Richard Vent became Rashid Vali, the Muslim husband of a Turkish lady. All was now set for him to start his actual mission in Turkey. As always, he was hundred percent confident of success" (Nesin, 2002, p. 113).

By translating "Veli" to "Vali" the translator has made orthographic adaptation with the name. However, surnames "Veli" and "Vali" have different meanings in Turkish.

---

<sup>3</sup> The misspellings at the texts are ignored by me as they are not the subject of this analyze.

#### Example 4.

##### Source Text

“Memur sesini gittikçe yükselterek, -Anlıyorum, anlıyorum... dedi, ama ne olursa olsun, sabah erkenden gelemez miydiniz ki....

Reşat Veli’ye doğru havayı iterek, -Rica ederim, yarın sabah erkenden gelin! Dedi.

Rıçart Veling, buradaki adıyla Reşat Veli, ünlü ajan OX-13, sokakta giderken derin düşüncelere dalmak zorundaydı. Zavallı ajan OX-13, hiç de istemeden casusluk görevini sürdürdü” (Nesin, 2005a, p. 19).

##### Target Text

“The official, raising his voice gradually as he spoke, said: «I understand. I understand. But whatever the case, why couldn’t raising his hand in disgust, interrupted him:

‘Please come tomorrow morning, and come early.’

On his way back from the counter-intelligence department that evening, Rashid was engrossed in deep thoughts. He reluctantly arrived at the conclusion that, whether one likes it or not, one has no option but to continue spying in that great country called Turkey. He was soon back to his assigned job as Agent Ox.” (Nesin, 2002, p. 120).

In the above example, the translator has used more sentences in the target text than the sentences in the source text and added explanations. As the translation of satire is a problematic issue for the translators while transferring both the humor and the message, the translator chooses the way of explaining the context in the source text for the target text reader.

#### Example 5.

##### Source Text

“Fareler Birbirlerini Yer” (Nesin, 2021, p. 126).

##### Target Text

“Beware of the Rats Amongst Us” (Nesin, 2002, p. 120).

For the example 5; in the source text, the story ends with the same sentence as in the title; the main idea of the story is directly stated both at the end of the story and in the title. However, in the target text, the translator uses a new title. The translator chooses to use the general idea in the short story that the reader should gather in case of the author’s message in the title. This may be the reason to make the source text more understandable for the target reader. Because in the story, Nesin tells about the one who climbs the ladder by stepping on others. In fact, this shows the corruption of the society: which is “ordinary in the society”. Nevertheless, the translator narrowed the meaning of the title, which gives that message: “pay attention, you can meet this kind of people”.

#### Example 6.

##### Source Text

“Fareler bol bol beslene beslene kedi kadar irileşmişler, gitgide semirip köpek kadar olmuşlar. Hiç dur durak yok, ambarın içinde koşup oynayıp, atlayıp sıçrayıp dolaşıyorlarmış. Üstelik ambarın içinde en güneşli, en güzel, en görüntülü yerlerini de onlar kapmışlar” (Nesin, 2021, p. 127).

##### Target Text

“Ultimately, they nourished themselves into cat-size rats, reaching the size of dogs in no time. There was no obstacle for them in the depot now. They could run around, play hide, and seek at will. The worst part of the game was that even the most sunny and beautiful parts of the depot also went under their occupation very soon” Nesin, 2002, p. 120).

As in the example 6, the author uses so many culture bound words in the source text. This kind of words’ translations are also a problematic issue. Thus, the translator translates this cultural words with the strategies in order to domesticate meaning for the reader.

### Example 7.

#### Source Text

“Şimdi sizlere bir soru: becerikli ambar yönetmeninin aklına, şeytanın bile aklına gelmeyecek bu kurnazlık nasıl geliyor? Fareleri birbirlerine yedirerek onları yok etme yöntemini nasıl buluyor?

Cevap: Çünkü o becerikli yönetmen, kendisi de, kendi türdeşlerini yok ede ede sağ kalan en güçlü fare gibi, kendi arkadaşlarını yiye yiye, yok ede ede, o büyüüük ambarın baş yönetmeni olmuştu. Kendi yaşamındaki başarı yöntemini farelere uygulamıştı

Sonuç: Fareler, birbirlerini yerler!... (Nesin, 2021, p. 129).

#### Target Text

“Although the story ends here, I have to ask you a question: How did the competent manager think of a trick like this, which the devil himself could never have thought of? How did he know that the rats would eat up one another?

Let me answer it for you. The rat of a competent manager was himself the most powerful survivor who had killed his own fellow creatures one by one, having fed himself upon his own friends, and ultimately managing to become the chief of the huge depot. He made use of the success of his own life, applying it to the rats in the depot.

The moreal of the story is: Rats eat one another” (Nesin, 2002, p. 155).

In the above example, Nesin, the author uses the illustrative language. Repetitions, exaggerations can be observed easily in the source text. However, Nesin style does not exist in the target text. By adding extra sentences and explanations, the translator gives the meaning in the source text story. Although, the style of the author cannot be understood by the target reader.

### Example 8.

#### Source Text

“Tarzan’ın Sahibi Kim?” (Nesin, 2005b, p. 67).

#### Target Text

“The Street Dog Named Tarzan” (Nesin, 2002, p. 96)

In the target text of the example 8, the translator makes explanations as the same strategy in the whole of the target text. In the source text title, the emphasis is on the owners of the Street dog (wild as Tarzan), who abuse the dog but later who would not like to give it to foreigners to be owned. Because, the story is about the dog and the abuse to him by his owners. However, in the target text title, the emphasis is on the dog itself which has interesting name evoking another story of *Tarzan*.

### Example 9.

#### Source Text

“Derken et suyuna papara yapıp Tarzan’a gönderenler de çoğaldı. Hepimizin akli Tarzan’da. –Aman Tarzan susuz kalmasin. Ağzı var, dili yok hayvanın. Yanar susuzluktan zavallı” (Nesin, 2005b, p.71).

#### Target Text

“By and by there was a growing number of people who would serve tarzan meat and broth. None of us ever left Tarzan out of our thoughts. One would often hear platitudes like: ‘Make sure Tarzan gets water to drink. The Poor animal has a tongue alright but it can ask for water. Let it not die of thirst’ (Nesin, 2002, p. 100).

In the example 9, while translating culture bound words such as “papara” and “ağzı var dili yok” in the source text, the translator makes explanations about them. In case of the form, he choose the meaning by adding extra words. It can be stated that this provides disappearance of the style of the author.

#### Example 10.

#### Source Text

“Demiryolu bekçisi Mehmet Efendi şahlandı: -Şuradan şuraya götüremezler... Ne demekmiş, bir mahallenin bir köpeği...

Düriye Teyze iki gözü iki çeşme, ağlıyor: -Elimde doğdu, büyüdü. Ben Tarzan’ı kimseciklere veremem. Haydi burada neyse, sevsinler diye verdik. Ameriya’ya da nasıl gidermiş... Evlerini başlarına yıkarım.

Bakkal İlyas ayaklandı: - Yahu kimin köpeğini kime veriyorsunuz? Bikez köpek benim. Onu şu kadarcıktan ben besleyip büyüttüm.

Memduh Bey, mahallemizin en aydını olduğundan kanunlara göre konuşup, -Biyere götüremezler, hiç merak etmeyin! Dedi.-Neden? Diye sorduk.

-Mevzuat müsait değil de ondan... Bikez Tarzan burda doğmuş, burda büyümüş, bu mahallede yetişmiş. Nasıl olur da yabancı memlekete götürürler. Pasaport vermezler bir... Ondan sonra...” (Nesin, 2005b, p. 71,2).

#### Target Text

“Memduh Efendi, the railroad watchmen, shouted with anger: ‘Nobody can take Tarzan from here. After all this is the only dog of the entire locality. That isn’t a joke.’

With tears rolling down her eyes, Aysha aunty sobbed:

‘It was born and brought up in my own hands, I can’t part with my sweet Tarzan. No, no, they cannot take it away. We only allowed them to keep it while they were here, and that too because we didn’t want them to deprived of this pleasure; but how on earth can we allow them to take it to America? I’ll ruin of them if they tried to:’

Ilyas, the grocer, also jumped in:

‘How can a third party arbitrarily decide whether Tarzan is to go to America? For once, the dog is mine. It was me who brought it up right from the time it was a small pup.’

Memduh Bey, the most enlightened person of our locality, talked in legal terms: ‘Don’t you worry folks. They cannot take Tarzan anywhere.’

‘Why not?’ We asked.

‘Because it is against the laws of this country. Tarzan was born here and it has been brought up here. How the hell can they take it to foreign country when it has no passport?’” (Nesin, 2002, p.101,2).

In the source text of the last example, the names of the people are given with their jobs, positions or features. This is a traditional way of naming in Turkey. In that way, the person is called with his/her characteristics forever. There are also culture bound words in the source text and while naming the person the humorizing language use by Aziz Nesin is very apparent. By translating these words source oriented and protecting the meaning in the source text, the language use and the meaning of the sentence has been reproduced in the target text. However, humorizing language is neglected. This made the disappearance of the style of the author.

#### 4. Discussion and Conclusion

It has been observed that the translator was broadly in favor of using unidiomatic explanations, thus the style of the author disappeared. Besides, some decisions of the translator distract and also interrupt our attention from the satire and change the linguistic effect of the words. Thus, as Lawrence Venuti (1998) stated in his work *The Scandals of Translation*, and considering that Aziz Nesin’s specified short stories are bestsellers, in the hope of a similar performance as the domestic one in a different language and culture, the translation of the short stories couldn’t reinforce literary, moral, religious, or political values already held by that reader. When the translations of the short stories have been analyzed, it has been seen that his translated work does not seem to have the same satirical aims as the original one. However, as a decision maker, the translator decides «the reasonable one» in a system of Pakistani (within English) that will also live among others through the aim of translation. In the preface, the translator decides what has to be done, and as a remedy how to translate Turkish into English for the literary circle of Pakistan. If the aim was the remedy, the translator did not give an importance to the satirical language and, of course, the identity of the author.

This paper has mainly focused on Aziz Nesin’s three short stories and the analyses of their translations. Considering Lawrence Venuti’s bestseller status features and the translator’s aim at the process of translation, both source texts and target texts have been accepted as bestsellers. To create the acceptable one through translation the translator created the socially acceptable one without considering the Bestseller status of a satirical work in the source system. Just, he focused on the author’s recognition in the Turkish literature system to make known the author in the Pakistani literature system. However, it can be beneficial and give a broad perspective to identify the translator’s aim. Thus, it is crucial to say that the translator reached his aim within his translation and the circulation of ideas has been realized through the translation. However, the translator has neglected the satire of the author and the target text has been placed within the new status as he mentions in the preface of the translation.

#### REFERENCES

- Bassnett, Susan. *Translation Studies*. (Third Edition). New York: Routledge, 2005.
- Culler, Jonathan. *Literary Theory, A Very Short Introduction*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2000.
- Genette, Gérard. *Paratexts: Thresholds of Interpretation*. No. 20. Cambridge University Press, 1997.
- Nesin, Aziz. *Laugh or Lament, Selected Short Stories of Aziz Nesin* (Translated from Turkish by Masud Akhtar Shaikh). Publication of the Ministry of Culture of the Republic of Turkey, 2002.
- Ajan OX-13, Nazik Alet. Nesin Publishing House, 2005a.
- Tarzan’ın Sahibi Kim?, Nazik Alet. Nesin Publishing House, 2005b.
- Fareler Birbirini Yer, Ah Biz Eşekler. Nesin Publishing House, 2021.
- Venuti, Lawrence. *The Scandals of Translation: Towards an Ethics of Difference*. Routledge, 2002.

## Online References

Ayhan, Hasan. (2022, November 13). Interview with Masud Akhtar Shaik. Konya Yeni Gün News.

<https://www.konyayenigun.com/roportaj/kultur-elcisi-pakistanli-yazar-masud-akhtar-shaik-h53081.html>

Mubeen, Khalid. (2022, November 13). Col.(R) Masud Akhtar Shaik----As a Translator of Turkish Literature to Urdu) A Critical Study

[https://www.academia.edu/40711900/Col\\_R\\_Masud\\_Akhtar\\_Shaik\\_As\\_a\\_Translator\\_of\\_Turkish\\_Literature\\_A\\_Critical\\_Study\\_Written\\_by\\_Dr\\_Khalid\\_Mubeen\\_Watch\\_my\\_youtube\\_drkhalidmubeen\\_https\\_www\\_youtube\\_com\\_channel\\_UCFw4DJW4dksKCsBV1r1UsMQ](https://www.academia.edu/40711900/Col_R_Masud_Akhtar_Shaik_As_a_Translator_of_Turkish_Literature_A_Critical_Study_Written_by_Dr_Khalid_Mubeen_Watch_my_youtube_drkhalidmubeen_https_www_youtube_com_channel_UCFw4DJW4dksKCsBV1r1UsMQ)

# “LAUGH OR LAMENT”: ÇEVİRİ SAYESİNDE DÜŞÜNCENİN DOLAŞIMI

Aslı ARABOĐLU

## ÖZET

Bu çalışmanın amacı, Aziz Nesin'in kısa öykülerinin İngilizceye çevrilerek derlenmesinden oluşan “Laugh or Lament” adlı eserin düşüncenin dolaşımına nasıl örnek olabileceğini göstermektir. Çalışmanın temel sorusu, kısa öykülerdeki hicivlerin çevrilmesi ve Aziz Nesin'in üslubuyla (olmayan) bir düşünce dolaşımı üzerine kuruludur. Farklı kuramsal bakış açılarıyla, Aziz Nesin'in hiciv üslubunun çevirilerini ele alan makale, düşüncenin çeviri yoluyla dolaşımını analiz etmeyi amaçlamaktadır. Türk edebiyatının en önemli yazarlarından biri olarak kabul edilen Aziz Nesin, hicivli diliyle ikiyüzlülüğün saçmalığını, toplumdaki yozlaşmayı, aşırı bürokrasinin insanlıktan çıkarıcı etkisini, yaşamdaki beklenmedik sorunları ve kültürel olan çözüm önerilerini hedefler. Edebiyat tarihi boyunca bilindiği gibi, en iyi hiciv eseri, okuyucuyu, yazarın amaçlarını anlamalarını sağlayarak kışkırtmalıdır. Aziz Nesin hedef kitlesi tarafından Türkçede çok iyi anlaşılmıştır. Yazarın eserleri yazıldığı dönemde ve günümüzde halen popüler edebiyat eseri statüsündedir. Ancak Aziz Nesin'in hikâyeleri sadece mizah duygusundan ibaret değil, aynı zamanda göndermelerle doludur. Nitekim Lawrence Venuti'nin (1998) *Çeviri Skandalları* (The Scandals of Translation) adlı eserinde belirttiği gibi, Aziz Nesin'in incelenen öykülerinin popüler yazın eserleri arasında yer aldığı düşünülerek, farklı bir dil ve kültürde benzer bir performansı gerçekleştirmesi ümidiyle kısa öykülerin çevirisinin, okuyucunun hâlihazırda sahip olduğu edebi, ahlaki, dini veya politik değerleri güçlendirmesi beklenir. Hikâyelerin çevirileri incelendiğinde, çevrilen eserin kaynak metinde yazarın oluşturduğu benzer hiciv amaçlarına sahip olmadığı görülmüştür. Ancak, düşüncenin dolaşımının çeviri, hiciv ve bilginin dönüşümüyle tamamlandığı söylenebilir. Bu çalışmanın amacı, Lawrence Venuti'nin “popüler yazın” kavramını kullanarak ve “popüler yazın” özelliklerini esas alarak çevirmenin tercihlerini analiz etmektir. Bu bakış açısı, çevirmenin tercihlerini anlamak için kapsamlı bir fikir sunabilir. Diğer yandan, düşüncenin dolaşımına bir örnek oluşturması maksadıyla, çevirinin bu “dolaşımı” nasıl etkilediği de bu çalışmanın kapsamında ele alınacaktır.

**Anahtar Sözcükler:** Aziz Nesin, popüler yazın, düşüncenin dolaşımı, hiciv